

UNITED STATES CIRCUIT COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

---

NATIONAL PHOTOGRAPH COMPANY,

Complainant-Appellee

vs.

AMERICAN GRAPHOPHONE COMPANY,

Defendant-Appellant.

---

TRANSCRIPT OF RECORD.

Appeal from the Circuit Court of the United States  
for the District of Connecticut.

---





# INDEX

Page

Judges' Return, - - - - -	1.
Bill of Complaint - - - - -	2.
Appearances - - - - -	7.
Answer - - - - -	8.
Replication - - - - -	12.
Amendment to Answer - - - - -	13.
Stipulation as to Defendant's Process, - - - - -	14.

## Complainant's Evidence .

### Complainant's Prima Facie Testimony .

Frank L. Dyer, Witness:	
Direct - examination - - - - -	16
Cross - - - - -	34
Re-direct - - - - -	88
Re-cross - - - - -	100
Albert Wurth, Witness:	
Direct - examination - - - - -	106
Cross - - - - -	121
Re-direct - - - - -	132
Re-cross - - - - -	132
A. Theo. E. Wangemann, Witness:	
Direct - examination - - - - -	133
Cross - - - - -	141
Re-direct - - - - -	153
Walter H. Miller, Witness:	
Direct - examination - - - - -	154
Cross - - - - -	162
Re-direct - - - - -	173
Re-cross - - - - -	173
Walter H. Miller, Witness, (Recalled):	
Direct - examination - - - - -	175
Cross - - - - -	175
Re-direct - - - - -	176
John F. Randolph, Witness:	
Direct - examination - - - - -	176
Cross - - - - -	177



John B. Schenckhorn, Witness:	178
Direct - examination	
Henri Hatch, Witness:	179
Direct - examination	
Alexander M. Pierrman, Witness:	180
Direct - examination	183
Cross	184.
Re-direct	
James W. Aylesworth, Witness:	185
Direct - examination	201
Cross	210
Re-direct	
Thomas A. Edison, Witness:	211
Direct - examination	227
Cross	234
Re-direct	

Complainant's Rebuttal Testimony

Frank L. Dyer, Witness:	237
Direct - examination	282
Cross	
Albert Wirth, Witness:	302
Direct - examination	306
Cross	
James W. Aylesworth, Witness, (Stipulated):	308
Direct - examination	310
Cross	311
Re-direct	312
Re-cross	
Thomas A. Edison, Witness, (Stipulated):	312.
Direct - examination	



# Complainant's EXHIBITS

## *Patents :*

Complainant's Exhibit Macdonald Re-  
issue  
Complainant's Exhibit Patent in Suit  
Complainant's Exhibit Edison Patent,  
No. 430,278  
Complainant's Exhibit Edison Patent,  
No. 484,582  
Complainant's Exhibit Miller & Ayls-  
worth Method Patent, No. 683,615  
Complainant's Exhibit Aylsworth &  
Miller Apparatus Patent No. 683,676  
Complainant's Exhibit Edison Patent  
No. 382,462  
Complainant's Exhibit Edison Patent  
No. 393,463  
Complainant's Exhibit Edison Patent  
No. 393,464  
Complainant's Exhibit Edison Patent  
No. 430,274

## *Physical :*

Complainant's Exhibit Dyer Experiment  
Complainant's Exhibit Wurth Note-book  
Complainant's Exhibit Record Mold F  
Complainant's Exhibit Apparatus for  
Duplicating by Expansion  
Complainant's Exhibit Record Mold 75  
Complainant's Exhibit Record Mold  
Sweet Home  
Complainant's Exhibit Record Mold  
Darling  
Complainant's Exhibit Record Mold  
Band  
Complainant's Exhibit Mold of 320-400  
Thread Record  
Complainant's Exhibit Wurth Plating  
Record



Complainant's Exhibit Record Mold of 1897 .....	117
Complainant's Exhibit Concert Record Mold .....	118
Complainant's Exhibit Wurth Thread Changer .....	121
Complainant's Exhibit National Phonograph Company's First Catalogue of Molded Records .....	158
Complainant's Exhibit Aylsworth Apparatus of Patent No. 667,662 .....	200
Complainant's Exhibit Record of Patent No. 667,662 No. 1 .....	200.
Complainant's Exhibit Record of Patent No. 667,662 No. 2 .....	200.
Complainant's Exhibit National Phonograph Co. Unfinished Blank No. 1 .....	210.
Complainant's Exhibit National Phonograph Co. Unfinished Blank No. 2 .....	210.
Complainant's Exhibit Schulze-Berge Note Book, April 11, 1888, to September 15, 1888 .....	236.
Complainant's Exhibit Schulze-Berge Note Book, September 27, 1888, to February 6, 1890 .....	236
Complainant's Exhibit Schulze-Berge Note Book, February 11, 1890, to January 21, 1891 .....	-- 236
Complainant's Exhibit Lioret No. 1 .....	-- 268
Complainant's Exhibit Lioret No. 2 .....	-- 269
Complainant's Exhibit Lioret No. 3 .....	-- 269
Complainant's Exhibit Lioret No. 4 .....	-- 270
Complainant's Exhibit Lioret No. 5 .....	-- 270
Complainant's Exhibit Lioret No. 6 .....	-- 270
Complainant's Exhibit Lioret No. 7 .....	-- 270
Complainant's Exhibit Lioret No. 8 .....	-- 271
Complainant's Exhibit Complainant's Duplicate Record Carton .....	-- 280



Complainant's Exhibit Defendant's  
Molded Record.....

Complainant's Exhibit Edison Molded  
Record.....

Complainant's Exhibit Split Mold.....

*Miscellaneous—Title Papers, etc.*

Complainant's Exhibit Assignment of  
Patent in Suit.....

Complainant's Exhibit Announcement of  
Advent of Defendant's Molded  
Records.....

Complainant's Exhibit National Phono-  
graph Co. Circular Letter of January  
13, 1902.....

Complainant's Exhibit Printed Circular  
of January 1, 1902.....

Complainant's Exhibit Translation of  
Schulze-Berge's Note Book, February  
11, 1890, to January 21, 1891.....

Complainant's Exhibit Edison Caveat of  
October 26, 1888.....

Complainant's Exhibit Certificate of  
Incorporation.....

Complainant's Exhibit Joyce File.....

Complainant's Exhibit Extract from Edi-  
son's English Patent No. 1644 of  
April 24, 1878.....

0718-22

282

282

302

15

165

179

179

180

215

236

249

281



Defendant's Evidence.

Defendant's Testimony.

Thomas H. Macdonald, Witness:

Direct - examination	- - - - -	314
Cross "	- - - - -	322
Re-direct "	- - - - -	339
Re-cross "	- - - - -	341

Recalled:

Direct - examination	- - - - -	354
Cross "	- - - - -	366
Re-direct "	- - - - -	373
Re-cross "	- - - - -	376

Recalled:

Direct - examination	- - - - -	384
----------------------	-----------	-----

A. E. Belcher, Witness:

Direct - examination	- - - - -	342
Cross "	- - - - -	343

Herbert A. Budlong, Witness:

Direct - examination	- - - - -	345
Cross "	- - - - -	346

Eugene E. Norton, Witness:

Direct - examination	- - - - -	351
----------------------	-----------	-----

Anson A. Stephenson, Witness:

Direct - examination	- - - - -	376
----------------------	-----------	-----

Eugene H. Byrnes, Witness:

Direct - examination	- - - - -	377
Cross "	- - - - -	378

Frank H. Osborne, Witness:

Direct - examination	- - - - -	378
Cross "	- - - - -	380

Edward D. Easton, Witness:

Direct - examination	- - - - -	381
----------------------	-----------	-----

Shelton T. Cameron, Witness:

Direct - examination	- - - - -	386
Cross "	- - - - -	431



# Index 7

Defendant's

EXHIBITS.

Offered. Price

	O. ON	
"Defendant's Exhibit, Macdonald 1895 Mold"-----	387	
"Defendant's Exhibit, Blank Mold"-----	387	
"Defendant's Exhibit, Chisel Point Recorder"-----	387	
"Defendant's Exhibit, Cast Record with Square Cut Groove"-----	387 ---	
 "Defendant's Exhibit, Photograph 1895 Mold"-----	516 ---	76
"Defendant's Exhibit, Photo. 1899 Mold No. 1"-----	516 ---	77
"Defendant's Exhibit, Photo. 1899 Mold No. 2"-----	516 ---	77
"Defendant's Exhibit, Graphophone- Phonograph Agreement"-----	383 - -	75
"Defendant's Exhibit, Extracts from Pub- lications Defining Shrinkage Rule"-----	385 ---	76
"Defendant's Exhibit, Circular of Jan., 1902"-----	346 ---	77
"Defendant's Exhibit, Certified Copy File Wrapper and Contents, Patent in Suit" Patent in Suit, No. 713,209-----	387 ---	58 67
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 303,970"-----	386 ---	68
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 341,214"-----	386 ---	68
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 341,287"-----	386 ---	69
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 382,417"-----	386 ---	70
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 382,462"-----	431 ---	70
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 393,462"-----	386 ---	71
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 393,463"-----	431 ---	71
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 400,647"-----	386 ---	71
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 400,648"-----	431 ---	71



# iii

"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 400,649"	431
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 400,650"	431
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 406,576"	386
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 414,761"	431
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 484,582"	386
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 488,191"	386
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 528,273"	386
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 559,806"	386
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 563,572"	386
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 606,725"	386
"Defendant's Exhibit, U. S. Patent No. 667,662"	386
"Defendant's Exhibit, British Patent No. 1478 of 1894 to Young"	386

Opinion, - - - - -

Final Decree, - - - - -

Petition of Appeal and Allowance of Same, - - - - -

Assignment of Errors, - - - - -

Appeal Bond and Approval of Same - - - - -

Citation - - - - -

Clerk's Certificate - - - - -